Carnegie Mellon University
Libraries

For more information: www.library.cmu.edu

Systematic Reviews (SR) in Business & Management: A New Role for Business Librarians

Ryan Splenda
Business & Economics Librarian
Carnegie Mellon University

Systematic Reviews: A Brief Overview

What are They?

- Methodical and comprehensive literature syntheses focused on well-formulated research questions.

Purpose?

- To identify and synthesize **ALL** scholarly research on a particular topic in order to:
  - 1. Provide evidence for practice and policy making OR identify gaps in research.
  - 2. To reduce bias.

Systematic Reviews: A Brief Overview

Steps in the SR Process

- 1. Identify research question.
- 2. Define inclusion & exclusion criteria.
- **3. Search for studies (LIBRARIANS!).**
- 4. Select studies for inclusion based on pre-defined criteria.
- 5. Extract data from included studies.
- 6. Evaluate the risk of bias included in studies.
- 7. Present results & assess quality of evidence.

Major Organizations

- Cochrane Collaboration (health and medicine)
- **Campbell Collaboration (social sciences)**

Cochrane

Campbell Collaboration
Better evidence for a better world

Campbell Collaboration: Training

Campbell Collaboration

- The organization devoted to evidence-based research (by way of SR's) in the social sciences.
- Organized into coordinating groups – NEW **Business & Management!**

Training – Search & Info Retrieval

- Search for all published **AND** unpublished studies (i.e., gray literature)
- Develop complex search strategies to capture all possible evidence on topic(s).

Our SR Protocol: The Team! The Team! The Team!

Denise Rousseau
Tepper/Heinz Faculty

ByeongJo Kim
Heinz PhD

Sarah Young
Heinz Liaison Librarian

Ryan Splenda
LOSER ☺

Our SR Protocol: Proof of Concept

"Does Executive Compensation Predict Publicly Traded Firms' Financial Performance and Inaccurate Financial Reporting?"

Search Strategy

Subscription Databases	**Gray Literature**
ABI/INFORM	NBER Working Papers
Business Source Ultimate	Bureau of Economic Analysis (BEA)
Emerald Management Research Collection	Board of Governors – Federal Reserve
EconLit	Federal Reserve Economic Data (FRED)
Web of Science – Core Collection	AEA Papers & Proceedings
Scopus	Social Sciences Research Network (SSRN)
Dissertations & Theses (ProQuest)	Research Papers in Economics (RePEc)
	Conference Board

ABI/INFORM

1	SU("Chief executive officers")	830,905
2	AB,TI(ceo OR ceos OR "chief executive officer*" OR "senior leader*" OR "corporate director*" OR executive*)	3,476,799
3	1 OR 2	3,991,863
4	SU(Bonuses OR "monetary incentives" OR "productivity incentives" OR compensation OR "stock options" OR "executive compensation")	498,887
5	AB,TI(bonus* OR incentiv* OR "pay for performance" OR compensation OR salary OR salaries OR "stock options" OR wages OR "performance award*" OR "performance based pay" OR "performance pay" OR "performance-related pay" OR "executive pay" OR "executive profit sharing")	1,117,469
6	4 OR 5	1,464,039
7	SU("financial performance")	1,832,519
8	AB,TI(firm* OR corporate OR corporation* OR company OR companies OR organizational OR financial OR business) NEAR/5 AB,TI(performance OR profit* OR "stock price" OR value OR sales OR revenue OR "market share" OR innovation OR growth OR "financial health" OR liquidity)	1,845,801
9	AB,TI("return on assets" OR ROA OR "return on income" OR ROI OR ROIC OR "return on invested capital" OR "return on capital" OR ROC OR "return on equity" OR ROE OR EBITDA OR "earnings before interest tax depreciation and amortization" OR "stock market returns" OR "equity pricing" OR "profit margin" OR "financial ratio" OR "merger and acquisition" OR "mergers and acquisitions")	858,270
10	7 OR 8 OR 9	3,884,570
11	SU("financial restatements" OR "accounting irregularities")	1696
12	AB,TI(financ* OR account* OR corporate) NEAR/5 AB,TI(misrepresent* OR restatement* OR mislead* OR negligen* OR irregular* OR inaccura* OR inconsisten* OR manipulate* OR decept* OR dishonest OR deceive* OR misreport* OR fraud* OR lying OR false)	40,028
13	11 OR 12	41,245
14	10 OR 13	3,920,617
15	3 AND 6 AND 14	19,727
16	Limits: Source Type—Scholarly Journals, Dissertations & Theses, Working Papers, Conference Papers & Proceedings	2451

Role of (Biz) Librarians: Info Specialists

Information Retrieval

- Craft best possible searches for studies in all literature databases.
- Serve as a disciplinary expert on research related to a particular field.

In My Case

- Thorough discussions with team members on various firm financial performance metrics. (ex. In-depth ratios and terminology used in the field.
- Mapping out which resources/databases to search.
- **Authorship of final SR!**

Photo Credits

Photo Credits:
"Author" image: https://searchengineland.com/secret-staying-relevant-authorship-184815
ByeongJo Kim: https://www.heinz.cmu.edu/faculty-research/profiles/kim-byeongjo/
Campbell Collaboration: https://campbellcollaboration.org/
Cochrane Organization: https://us.cochrane.org/
Denise Rousseau: https://www.heinz.cmu.edu/faculty-research/profiles/rousseau-denisem
Ryan Splenda: https://guides.library.cmu.edu/prf.php?account_id=103421
Sarah Young: https://guides.library.cmu.edu/prf.php?account_id=117978

Carnegie Mellon University
Libraries